

Psychoanalytic therapy (PT) and cognitive-behavioral therapy (CBT) in outpatients with anxiety (panic disorder/agoraphobia) and comorbid personality disorders.

Submission date 12/09/2014	Recruitment status No longer recruiting	<input type="checkbox"/> Prospectively registered <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Protocol
Registration date 12/12/2014	Overall study status Completed	<input type="checkbox"/> Statistical analysis plan <input type="checkbox"/> Results
Last Edited 30/12/2025	Condition category Mental and Behavioural Disorders	<input type="checkbox"/> Individual participant data <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Record updated in last year

Plain English summary of protocol

Background and study aims

In this study, we want to investigate patients that suffer from both anxiety disorder and personality disorder. There is, at present, not enough evidence to suggest psychoanalytic therapy is a successful treatment for anxiety disorders and few studies have been carried out that have investigated the high number of these patients suffering from other mental disorders at the same time (comorbidity). As a relatively high number of patients with panic disorder and/or agoraphobia also have a personality disorder, we want to carry out a study comparing psychoanalytic therapy (PT) and cognitive-behavior therapy (CBT) for this combined condition. Both treatments are examined in terms of how successful they are at treating the patients, how long patients remain well after treatment and how cost effective the two treatments are over time.

Who can participate?

Participants should be adults that are at least 21 years old. They must also have been diagnosed with a panic disorder and/or agoraphobia and have at least one personality disorder.

What does the study involve?

Participants are randomly allocated into one of two groups. Those in group 1 receive PT. Those in group 2 receive CBT. Patients receiving either treatment are able to see several therapists before selecting one to work with and therapists, in turn, are able to refuse to treat a specific patient. Both treatments, PT and CBT, are basically described in the German guidelines. PT and CBT manuals for treating patients with panic and personality disorders have also been developed for the study. However, the CBT manual should only serve as a compass for the CBT study therapists, who are otherwise free to carry out "CBT as usual". All study therapists have had several years of training and a license to practice as psychological or medical psychotherapist in the particular treatment. To guarantee treatment integrity, all sessions are audio-recorded. Each participant is followed up once a year for a period of six years from the start of their treatment. They are asked to take part in interviews and complete questionnaires.

Questionnaires include general information (age, sex, level of education, school/profession, family status/partnership, etc.) as well as covering subjects such as symptoms, interpersonal problems (problems with building and maintaining relationships with others), life satisfaction, working alliance (relationship between themselves and healthcare professionals), and others. Therapists also fill in a number of questionnaires on, for example, their patient's diagnosis, the number and frequency of the treatment sessions, any changes in the therapeutic setting and how they think the treatment progressed.

What are the possible benefits and risks of participating?

Benefits for patients participating in the study are that they receive a therapy for their condition within a particular therapeutic setting. Possible risks are known unwanted side-effects of psychotherapy treatments. Additionally, some patients may be given a treatment that does not meet their expectations of psychotherapy. It is assumed that both CBT and PT lead to significant improvements. However, these improvements are expected to be longer term for patients treated with PT.

Where is the study run from?

University of Kassel (Germany).

When is the study starting and how long is it expected to run for?

April 2012 to April 2024.

Who is funding the study?

German Society for Psychoanalysis, Psychotherapy, Psychosomatics and Depth Psychology (Deutsche Gesellschaft für Psychoanalyse, Psychotherapie, Psychosomatik und Tiefenpsychologie - DGPT) (Germany).

Who is the main contact?

Dr Miriam Henkel, miriam.henkel@uni-kassel.de

Contact information

Type(s)

Scientific

Contact name

Dr Miriam Henkel

ORCID ID

<https://orcid.org/0000-0002-6723-8529>

Contact details

Department of Psychology
University of Kassel
Holländische Str. 36-38
Kassel
Germany
34127

Additional identifiers

Protocol serial number

N/A

Study information

Scientific Title

Psychoanalytic therapy (PT) and cognitive-behavioral therapy (CBT) in outpatients with anxiety (panic disorder/agoraphobia) and comorbid personality disorders: a multicenter prospective randomized superiority trial

Acronym

APD study (anxiety and personality disorders)

Study objectives

Patients treated with PT show a significantly better long-term outcome (six years after baseline) than those with CBT.

Ethics approval required

Old ethics approval format

Ethics approval(s)

Ethics Board of the Faculty of Human Sciences, University of Kassel, approved on 16/11/2011
Ethics Board of the Faculty of Medicine, University of Heidelberg, approved on 29/12/2011
Ethics Board of the Ärztekammer Hamburg, approved on 25/07/2013.

Study design

Multicenter prospective randomized superiority trial with two parallel arms

Primary study design

Interventional

Study type(s)

Treatment

Health condition(s) or problem(s) studied

Panic disorder, Agoraphobia, Personality disorder

Interventions

Participants will be randomised into one of the two arms:

1. Psychoanalytic therapy (PT)
2. Cognitive-behavior therapy (CBT)

They will be assessed at the study centre before treatment, after termination of treatment and at a 6-year follow-up. Additional self-report questionnaire and LIFE-Interviews once a year.

Intervention Type

Behavioural

Primary outcome(s)

Primary outcome measure as of 23/05/2016:

1. Overall symptomatic burden according to LIFE-interview over the 6 year follow-up-period

2. Individual change in patients self-reports (combination symptomatic burden, SCL-90-GSI, interpersonal problems, IIP, and life satisfaction, FLZ) between beginning of treatment and 6-year-follow-up

Original primary outcome measures:

1. Individual change in mental disorders (according to SCID-Interviews, Axis I and Axis II) between beginning of treatment and 6-year-follow-up
2. Individual change in patients self-reports (combination symptomatic burden, SCL-90-GSI, interpersonal problems, IIP, and life satisfaction, FLZ) between beginning of treatment and 6-year-follow-up

Key secondary outcome(s)

Secondary outcome measure as of 23/05/2016:

1. Individual change in criteria for personality disorders (according to SCID-interview, axis II)
2. Patients Health Questionnaire (PHQ)
3. Assessment of DSM-IV Personality Disorders (ADP-IV)
4. Panik- und Agoraphobieskala (PAS)
5. Experiences in Close Relationships - Revised (ECR)
6. Structural Impairment, assessed with: Inventory of Personality Organization short form (IPO-16), Operationalized Psychodynamic Diagnostics (OPD), and Scales of Psychological Capacities (SPC)
7. Short Form Health Survey (SF-12)
8. Willingness-to-pay (WTP)

Original secondary outcome measures:

1. Overall symptomatic burden according to LIFE over the 6 year follow-up-period
2. Patients Health Questionnaire (PHQ)
3. Assessment of DSM-IV Personality Disorders (ADP-IV)
4. Panik- und Agoraphobieskala (PAS)
5. Experiences in Close Relationships - Revised (ECR)
6. Structural Impairment, assessed with: Inventory of Personality Organization short form (IPO-16), Operationalized Psychodynamic Diagnostics (OPD), and Scales of Psychological Capacities (SPC)
7. Short Form Health Survey (SF-12)
8. Willingness-to-pay (WTP)

Completion date

01/04/2024

Eligibility

Key inclusion criteria

1. Panic disorder (including partial remission, i.e., maximally 2 months without significant symptoms) and/or agoraphobia plus:
2. At least one of the following PDs: avoidant PD, dependent PD, obsessive-compulsive PD, depressive PD, negativistic PD, histrionic PD, borderline PD without acute suicidality, narcissistic PD, PD not otherwise specified (i.e., in at least two of the PD categories listed above only 1 criterion is missing to fulfill the diagnosis)
3. Age: at least 21 years

Participant type(s)

Patient

Healthy volunteers allowed

No

Age group

Mixed

Lower age limit

21 years

Upper age limit

100 years

Sex

All

Total final enrolment

0

Key exclusion criteria

1. Bipolar affective disorder, psychotic disorder, acute eating disorder, substance-related disorder (except caffeine and nicotine), Cluster-A PDs, antisocial PD, borderline PD with acute suicidality
2. Neurological diseases (with psychologically significant consequences, e.g., epilepsy)
3. Insufficient knowledge of the German language
4. Strong preference for one of the two treatment conditions
5. Current medication with benzodiazepine

Date of first enrolment

01/04/2012

Date of final enrolment

01/04/2024

Locations

Countries of recruitment

Germany

Study participating centre

University of Kassel

Mönchebergstraße 19

Kassel

Germany

34125

Sponsor information

Organisation

German Society for Psychoanalysis, Psychotherapy, Psychosomatics and Depth Psychology (DGPT) (Germany)

ROR

<https://ror.org/01hd27x96>

Funder(s)

Funder type

Research organisation

Funder Name

German Society for Psychoanalysis, Psychotherapy, Psychosomatics and Depth Psychology (Deutsche Gesellschaft für Psychoanalyse, Psychotherapie, Psychosomatik und Tiefenpsychologie - DGPT) (Germany)

Results and Publications

Individual participant data (IPD) sharing plan

IPD sharing plan summary

Not provided at time of registration

Study outputs

Output type	Details	Date created	Date added	Peer reviewed?	Patient-facing?
Protocol article	protocol	01/09/2016	15/02/2021	Yes	No
Study website	Study website	11/11/2025	11/11/2025	No	Yes