ChatGPT in lesson preparation - A Teacher Choices Trial

| Submission date 17/07/2024 | Recruitment status No longer recruiting | Prospectively registered[X] Protocol |
|-------------------------------------|---|---|
| Registration date 25/07/2024 | Overall study status Completed | [X] Statistical analysis plan [X] Results |
| Last Edited 15/01/2025 | Condition category Other | Individual participant data |

Plain English summary of protocol

Background and study aims

Generative AI (GenAI) in one of its most well-known forms (ChatGPT) has only been available to the public since November 2022 and already has more than 100 million weekly active (global) users. ChatGPT is a large language model which generates human-like text responses to questions or prompts entered by users. It has been trained on data from the internet including websites, books, articles and manuals which it uses to predict the next word in a sequence. It has been designed to respond in an accessible and conversational manner allowing users to engage in natural language interactions on various topics and almost anyone can interact with the program once they have a log in. The Department for Education (DfE) in England recognised that the education sector was using GenAI with increasing regularity and issued a call for evidence on the topic in 2023. It showed that these tools are already being used for lesson planning, creating resources, and writing exam guestions. Benefits of using GenAI were reported to include 'freeing up teacher time, providing additional educational support, including for pupils and students with special educational needs and disabilities (SEND) and pupils and students for whom English is an additional language (EAL), and subject specific applications'. Although the Education Secretary has said that "AI will have the power to transform a teacher's day-to-day work", there is limited research on how teachers are actually using AI.

Who can participate?

Any state secondary school in England can take part as long as there is at least one teacher who teaches Years 7 and/or Year 8 science, and who completes the baseline survey. Any science teacher who teaches Years 7 and/or Year 8 science (including non-specialist science teachers and Early Career Teachers (ECT)) at a participating school and who is willing to be part of the trial can take part. Teachers are only considered eligible once they complete the baseline teacher survey for the trial.

What does the study involve?

This is a cluster trial with randomisation at school-level. Schools were randomly assigned to one of two arms with equal allocations. The two arms are the ChatGPT group and the Non-GenAI group. In the ChatGPT group, science teachers are asked to use ChatGPT to prepare lessons and resources for upcoming Year 7 and/or 8 science lessons. They will also receive access to the online ChatGPT guide to guide their lesson and resource preparation. In the Non-GenAI group,

science teachers are asked not to use ChatGPT or any other GenAI tool in any lesson and resource preparation for their Year 7 and/or 8 science lessons. Teachers will be asked to complete a weekly diary during ten weeks of the 2024 summer term regarding the lessons they delivered in each week.

What are the possible benefits and risks of participating? The primary hypothesis of the study is that using ChatGPT will beneficially reduce workload for teachers. We do not anticipate any side effects of trial participation.

Where is the study run from? The National Foundation for Educational Research (https://www.nfer.ac.uk/)

When is the study starting and how long is it expected to run for? December 2023 to July 2024

Who is funding the study? The study funder is jointly funded by the Education Endowment Foundation (https://educationendowmentfoundation.org.uk/) and the Hg Foundation (https://www. thehgfoundation.com/)

Who is the main contact? Palak Roy, Senior Trials Manager at NFER, p.roy@nfer.ac.uk

Study website

https://educationendowmentfoundation.org.uk/projects-and-evaluation/projects/choices-in-edtech-using-generative-ai-chatgpt-for-ks3-science-lesson-preparation-2024-teacher-choices-trial

Contact information

Type(s)

Public

Contact name Mrs Palak Roy

ORCID ID

http://orcid.org/0009-0009-3951-5937

Contact details

National Foundation for Educational Research The Mere Upton Park Slough United Kingdom SL1 2DQ +44 (0)1753 574123 p.roy@nfer.ac.uk

Type(s)

Scientific

Contact name Miss Ruth Staunton

ORCID ID http://orcid.org/0009-0000-7079-4844

Contact details

National Foundation for Educational Research The Mere Upton Park Slough United Kingdom SL1 2DQ +44 (0)1753 574123 r.staunton@nfer.ac.uk

Type(s) Principal Investigator

Contact name Mrs Helen Poet

Contact details National Foundation for Educational Research The Mere Upton Park Slough United Kingdom SL1 2DQ +44 (0)1753 574123 h.poet@nfer.ac.uk

Additional identifiers

EudraCT/CTIS number Nil known

IRAS number

ClinicalTrials.gov number Nil known

Secondary identifying numbers Nil known

Study information

Scientific Title

A two-armed randomised controlled trial investigating the effect of ChatGPT use during lesson preparation on the time spent on lesson preparation by teachers of Year 7 and/or Year 8 science classes over a 5-week period

Study objectives

Primary hypothesis:

Teacher lesson and resource preparation time for Year 7 & 8 science lessons over five weeks (second half of summer term 2024) will not be equal in ChatGPT and Non-GenAI groups.

Secondary hypotheses:

Teacher lesson and resource preparation time for Year 7 & 8 science lessons over five weeks (first half of summer term 2024) will not be equal in ChatGPT and Non-GenAI groups. The quality of lesson and resource materials used in Year 7 & 8 science lessons will not be equal in ChatGPT and Non-GenAI groups.

The proportion of lessons for which teachers use ChatGPT will not be equal in the first five week period and the second five week period.

Ethics approval required

Ethics approval required

Ethics approval(s)

Approved 09/01/2024, NFER Code of Practice Group (The Mere, Upton Park, Slough, SL1 2DQ, United Kingdom; +44 (0)1753574123; Enquiries@nfer.ac.uk), ref: EEAI

Study design

Two-armed cluster (school)-randomized controlled trial

Primary study design

Interventional

Secondary study design Cluster randomised trial

Study setting(s) School

Study type(s) Treatment

Participant information sheet See study outputs table

Health condition(s) or problem(s) studied Teacher workload

Interventions

This is a two-armed randomised controlled trial. The randomisation is at the school level which is stratified by school size (i.e., the number of participating teachers per school). The stratification variable was the number of teachers, cut into two categories. Within each stratum, schools were randomised to one of two study groups through simple random assignment in R. Participating

science teachers will be asked to implement their allocated approach for 10 weeks over the summer term of 2024 with their Year 7 and/or Year 8 classes. The two arms are: ChatGPT and Non-GenAI.

In the ChatGPT group, teachers are asked to use ChatGPT when preparing for lessons and creating resources.

In the Non-GenAI group, teachers are asked to not use any GenAI tools (ChatGPT or otherwise) when preparing for lessons and creating resources.

For both groups, the teacher guide emphasises that teachers do not need to create any additional lesson resources or do any additional planning specifically for this project, over and above what they usually would. All teachers are asked to teach their lessons as normal.

Intervention Type

Other

Primary outcome measure

Total hours spent in lesson and resource preparation measured using data collated from a weekly teacher diary over a five-week period (second half of summer 2024 term)

Secondary outcome measures

1. Total hours spent in lesson and resource preparation measured using data collated from a weekly teacher diary over a five-week period (first half of summer 2024 term)

2. Quality of lesson and resource materials used measured using ranking of teachers' lesson resources by an independent panel of teachers in the second five-week period

3. Proportion of science lessons where ChatGPT was used for lesson and resource preparation measured using a weekly teacher diary over a five-week period

4. Proportion of weeks when the ChatGPT teacher guide was consulted at least once measured using a weekly teacher diary in each five-week period

Overall study start date

11/12/2023

Completion date

31/07/2024

Eligibility

Key inclusion criteria

1. School eligibility: Any state secondary school in England can take part as long as there is at least one teacher who teaches Years 7 and/or Year 8 science, and who completes the baseline survey

2. Teacher eligibility: Any science teacher who teaches at an eligible school, who teaches Years 7 and/or Year 8 science (including non-specialist science teachers and Early Career Teachers (ECT)), and who is willing to be part of the trial. Teachers are only considered eligible once they complete the baseline teacher survey for the trial.

Participant type(s)

Learner/student

Age group Mixed **Sex** Both

Target number of participants 174

Total final enrolment 258

Key exclusion criteria Participants will be excluded if they request to withdraw from the trial

Date of first enrolment 01/02/2024

Date of final enrolment 12/03/2024

Locations

Countries of recruitment England

United Kingdom

Study participating centre

National Foundation for Educational Research (NFER) The Mere Upton Park Slough Slough United Kingdom SL1 2DQ

Sponsor information

Organisation

National Foundation for Educational Research

Sponsor details

The Mere, Upton Park Slough England United Kingdom SL1 2DQ +44 (0)1753 574123 info@eefoundation.org.uk

Sponsor type Research organisation

Website https://www.nfer.ac.uk/

ROR https://ror.org/044sxgs38

Funder(s)

Funder type Research organisation

Funder Name Education Endowment Foundation

Alternative Name(s) EducEndowFoundn, Education Endowment Foundation | London, EEF

Funding Body Type Private sector organisation

Funding Body Subtype Trusts, charities, foundations (both public and private)

Location United Kingdom

Funder Name Hg Foundation

Results and Publications

Publication and dissemination plan

Teacher accessible output and trial report will be published on EEF website https://educationendowmentfoundation.org.uk/projects-and-evaluation/projects/choices-inedtech-using-generative-ai-chatgpt-for-ks3-science-lesson-preparation-2024-teacher-choicestrial

Intention to publish date

09/12/2024

Individual participant data (IPD) sharing plan

The datasets generated during and/or analysed during the current study will be available upon request from FFT Education. The EEF data archive is managed by FFT Education (FFT) and held by the ONS within their Secure Research service. https://educationendowmentfoundation.org.uk /privacy-notices/privacy-notice-for-the-eef-data-archive

IPD sharing plan summary

Available on request

| Study outputs | | | | | |
|-------------------------------|-------------|--------------|------------|----------------|-----------------|
| Output type | Details | Date created | Date added | Peer reviewed? | Patient-facing? |
| Participant information sheet | | 05/02/2024 | 18/07/2024 | Νο | Yes |
| <u>Protocol file</u> | version 1.0 | | 23/07/2024 | No | No |
| Statistical Analysis Plan | version 1.0 | | 23/07/2024 | No | No |
| Funder report results | | 31/12/2024 | 15/01/2025 | No | No |