

# Open surgery versus arthroscopy for treating traumatic instability of the shoulder in adults

<b>Submission date</b> 29/06/2010	<b>Recruitment status</b> No longer recruiting	<input type="checkbox"/> Prospectively registered
<b>Registration date</b> 06/08/2010	<b>Overall study status</b> Completed	<input type="checkbox"/> Protocol
<b>Last Edited</b> 30/10/2012	<b>Condition category</b> Injury, Occupational Diseases, Poisoning	<input type="checkbox"/> Statistical analysis plan
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Results
		<input type="checkbox"/> Individual participant data

**Plain English summary of protocol**  
Not provided at time of registration

## Contact information

**Type(s)**  
Scientific

**Contact name**  
Mr Nicola Archetti Netto

**Contact details**  
Department of Orthopaedics and Traumatology,  
Universidade Federal de São Paulo,  
Rua Borges Lagoa,  
783 - 5th Floor  
São Paulo  
Brazil  
04038-032  
+55 11 5571 6621  
narchetti@uol.com.br

## Additional identifiers

**Protocol serial number**  
N/A

## Study information

**Scientific Title**

Repair of Bankart lesion in traumatic anterior shoulder instability: open surgery versus arthroscopic technique - a randomised controlled trial

### **Study objectives**

There is no difference between open versus arthroscopic interventions for treating traumatic anterior shoulder instability.

### **Ethics approval required**

Old ethics approval format

### **Ethics approval(s)**

The Ethics Committee of the Universidade Federal de São Paulo/Hospital São Paulo approved in August 2003 (ref: CEP 0901/03 UNIFESP)

### **Study design**

Randomised active controlled parallel group clinical trial

### **Primary study design**

Interventional

### **Study type(s)**

Treatment

### **Health condition(s) or problem(s) studied**

Traumatic anterior shoulder instability

### **Interventions**

After arthroscopic examination, participants were randomised to:

1. Open surgery
2. Arthroscopic surgery

Total duration of treatment was approximately 1 hour for open surgery and 1 hour for arthroscopy. Total duration of follow-up was from 20 to 56 months for open surgery and from 18 to 56 months for arthroscopy.

### **Intervention Type**

Other

### **Phase**

Not Applicable

### **Primary outcome(s)**

1. Disability of Arm Shoulder and Hand (DASH) Questionnaire
2. UCLA Shoulder Rating Scale
3. Rowe Score for Instability

Identical care program for rehabilitation was done in each of compared groups. Following enrolment in the study, all the participants were assessed every week during the first 2 weeks and at the 4th and 8th weeks; thereafter, monthly until the final examination. All primary and secondary outcomes were reported.

### **Key secondary outcome(s)**

Range of movement: passive range of motion measurements, specifically forward flexion and internal and external rotation at 90° of abduction, were recorded and compared with the patients' nonoperative side.

Identical care program for rehabilitation was done in each of compared groups. Following enrolment in the study, all the participants were assessed every week during the first 2 weeks and at the 4th and 8th weeks; thereafter, monthly until the final examination. All primary and secondary outcomes were reported.

### **Completion date**

01/12/2006

## **Eligibility**

### **Key inclusion criteria**

1. Adults aged 18 - 40 years, either sex
2. Radiographic confirmation of a first-time anterior shoulder dislocation caused by an external force applied to the shoulder in a fall, or other forceful injury
3. No associated fracture visible on conventional radiographs at the time of presentation
4. Clinical history and symptoms of anterior shoulder instability
5. No medical contraindications to general anaesthesia
6. Detection of a Bankart lesion (anteroinferior capsulolabral detachment) on the arthroscopic examination of the shoulder

### **Participant type(s)**

Patient

### **Healthy volunteers allowed**

No

### **Age group**

Adult

### **Lower age limit**

18 years

### **Upper age limit**

40 years

### **Sex**

All

### **Key exclusion criteria**

1. Aged under 18 or over 40 years
2. Patients with generalised joint laxity, bilateral instability, multidirectional instability, and an additional soft-tissue injury that could affect joint stability
3. Patients with convulsive disorders, collagen diseases, previous surgery of the shoulder and

- any other condition that affects the shoulder mobility
4. Cerebrovascular disease or other severe medical illness
  5. Inability to give informed consent or to complete questionnaires

**Date of first enrolment**

01/11/2003

**Date of final enrolment**

01/12/2006

## **Locations**

**Countries of recruitment**

Brazil

**Study participating centre**

Department of Orthopaedics and Traumatology,

São Paulo

Brazil

04038-032

## **Sponsor information**

**Organisation**

Universidade Federal de Sao Paulo (UNIFESP) (Brazil)

**ROR**

<https://ror.org/00bkgf580>

## **Funder(s)**

**Funder type**

University/education

**Funder Name**

Universidade Federal de Sao Paulo (UNIFESP) (Brazil)

## **Results and Publications**

Individual participant data (IPD) sharing plan

## IPD sharing plan summary

Not provided at time of registration

## Study outputs

Output type	Details	Date created	Date added	Peer reviewed?	Patient-facing?
<a href="#">Results article</a>	results	01/07/2012		Yes	No