Open surgery versus arthroscopy for treating traumatic instability of the shoulder in adults

Submission date 29/06/2010	Recruitment status No longer recruiting	☐ Prospectively registered☐ Protocol
Registration date 06/08/2010	Overall study status Completed	Statistical analysis plan [X] Results
Last Edited 30/10/2012	Condition category Injury, Occupational Diseases, Poisoning	Individual participant data

Plain English summary of protocol

Not provided at time of registration

Contact information

Type(s)

Scientific

Contact name

Mr Nicola Archetti Netto

Contact details

Department of Orthopaedics and Traumatology, Universidade Federal de São Paulo, Rua Borges Lagoa, 783 - 5th Floor São Paulo Brazil 04038-032 +55 11 5571 6621 narchetti@uol.com.br

Additional identifiers

Protocol serial number N/A

Study information

Scientific Title

Repair of Bankart lesion in traumatic anterior shoulder instability: open surgery versus arthroscopic technique - a randomised controlled trial

Study objectives

There is no difference between open versus arthroscopic interventions for treating traumatic anterior shoulder instability.

Ethics approval required

Old ethics approval format

Ethics approval(s)

The Ethics Committee of the Universidade Federal de São Paulo/Hospital São Paulo approved in August 2003 (ref: CEP 0901/03 UNIFESP)

Study design

Randomised active controlled parallel group clinical trial

Primary study design

Interventional

Study type(s)

Treatment

Health condition(s) or problem(s) studied

Traumatic anterior shoulder instability

Interventions

After arthroscopic examination, participants were randomised to:

- 1. Open surgery
- 2. Arthroscopic surgery

Total duration of treatment was approximately 1 hour for open surgery and 1 hour for arthroscopy. Total duration of follow-up was from 20 to 56 months for open surgery and from 18 to 56 months for arthroscopy.

Intervention Type

Other

Phase

Not Applicable

Primary outcome(s)

- 1. Disability of Arm Shoulder and Hand (DASH) Questionnaire
- 2. UCLA Shoulder Rating Scale
- 3. Rowe Score for Instability

Identical care program for rehabilitation was done in each of compared groups. Following enrolment in the study, all the participants were assessed every week during the first 2 weeks and at the 4th and 8th weeks; thereafter, monthly until the final examination. All primary and secondary outcomes were reported.

Key secondary outcome(s))

Range of movement: passive range of motion measurements, specifically forward flexion and internal and external rotation at 90° of abduction, were recorded and compared with the patients' nonoperative side.

Identical care program for rehabilitation was done in each of compared groups. Following enrolment in the study, all the participants were assessed every week during the first 2 weeks and at the 4th and 8th weeks; thereafter, monthly until the final examination. All primary and secondary outcomes were reported.

Completion date

01/12/2006

Eligibility

Key inclusion criteria

- 1. Adults aged 18 40 years, either sex
- 2. Radiographic confirmation of a first-time anterior shoulder dislocation caused by an external force applied to the shoulder in a fall, or other forceful injury
- 3. No associated fracture visible on conventional radiographs at the time of presentation
- 4. Clinical history and symptoms of anterior shoulder instability
- 5. No medical contraindications to general anaesthesia
- 6. Detection of a Bankart lesion (anteroinferior capsulolabral detachment) on the arthroscopic examination of the shoulder

Participant type(s)

Patient

Healthy volunteers allowed

No

Age group

Adult

Lower age limit

18 years

Upper age limit

40 years

Sex

All

Key exclusion criteria

- 1. Aged under 18 or over 40 years
- 2. Patients with generalised joint laxity, bilateral instability, multidirectional instability, and an additional soft-tissue injury that could affect joint stability
- 3. Patients with convulsive disorders, collagen diseases, previous surgery of the shoulder and

any other condition that affects the shoulder mobility

- 4. Cerebrovascular disease or other severe medical illness
- 5. Inability to give informed consent or to complete questionnaires

Date of first enrolment

01/11/2003

Date of final enrolment

01/12/2006

Locations

Countries of recruitment

Brazil

Study participating centre

Department of Orthopaedics and Traumatology,
São Paulo
Brazil

Sponsor information

Organisation

04038-032

Universidade Federal de Sao Paulo (UNIFESP) (Brazil)

ROR

https://ror.org/00bkgf580

Funder(s)

Funder type

University/education

Funder Name

Universidade Federal de Sao Paulo (UNIFESP) (Brazil)

Results and Publications

Individual participant data (IPD) sharing plan

IPD sharing plan summaryNot provided at time of registration

Study outputs

Output type	Details	Date created D	ate added	Peer reviewed?	Patient-facing?
Results article	results	01/07/2012		Yes	No
Participant information sheet	Participant information sheet	11/11/2025 1	1/11/2025	No	Yes