ISRCTN10574132 https://doi.org/10.1186/ISRCTN10574132

A comparison on effects of clay art therapy and mandala coloring on emotion regulation, hope and resilience in secondary school students

Submission date
30/07/2020

Recruitment status
No longer recruiting

Registration date
04/08/2020

Overall study status
Completed

Last Edited
07/08/2020

Condition category
Mental and Behavioural Disorders

[ ] Prospectively registered
[X] Protocol
[ ] Statistical analysis plan
[ ] Results
[ ] Individual participant data
[ ] Record updated in last year

Plain English summary of protocol

Background and study aims:
Serious emotional problems of teens have become a pressing issue in Hong Kong (HK). While causes of the problems are inconclusive, effective measures to combat stress and control teen suicide carry vital significance. As the literature shows that art therapy has positive impacts on mood and emotional control, this study aims to specifically investigate the efficacy of clay art therapy (CAT) and mandala coloring (COM) in regulating emotion of Hong Kong senior secondary school students.

Who can participate?
Hong Kong senior secondary students, aged between 15 and 18 with needs of psychological support.

What does the study involve?
Participants were randomly allocated to receive either the CAT or COM for six, two-hour weekly sessions, to engage with the specific art form and create artwork. The participants were required to complete a set of questionnaires and collect salivary cortisol at three different time-points (T0- baseline; T1- immediately after the intervention; T2- 6 weeks after the intervention) to allow comparison of the interventions' effectiveness.

What are the possible benefits and risks of participating?
Participants will be able to receive 6 sessions of free clay art therapy/mandala coloring sessions that will be instructed by registered art therapists. During the session, participants can learn different skills and techniques of art making, freely express their own thoughts and emotions through art activities, which have possible effects of soothing emotions. The procedure has no known risks.

Where is the study run from?
Hong Kong Baptist University

When is the study starting and how long is it expected to run for?
January 2017 to February 2019

Who is funding the study?
The University of Hong Kong’s Seed Funding for Applied Research and the Hong Kong Baptist University’s Faculty Research Grant

Who is the main contact?
Dr Joshua Nan
joshuanan@hkbu.edu.hk

Contact information

Type(s)
Scientific

Contact name
Dr Joshua KM Nan

ORCID ID
https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4840-6539

Contact details
Hong Kong Baptist University
Room 1012A, 10/F AAB Building
Hong Kong Baptist University Road
Kowloon Tong
Hong Kong
Hong Kong
-
+852 34112009
joshuanan@hkbu.edu.hk

Type(s)
Scientific

Contact name
Miss Wendy WT Wong

Contact details
Hong Kong Baptist University
Room 1012A, 10/F AAB Building
Hong Kong Baptist University Road
Kowloon Tong
Hong Kong
Hong Kong
-
+852 34112483
wendywwt@hkbu.edu.hk

Additional identifiers

Protocol serial number
FRG1/17-18/039

Study information

Scientific Title
A comparative study on the effects of clay art therapy and coloring of mandalas on positive-negative affective states, hope, and resilience for senior secondary school students — A randomized controlled trial

Study objectives
1. Both the clay art therapy and the coloring of mandala groups would report improvements in symptoms of affective status, signs of anxiety and depression, hope, and resilience at post-intervention
2. The clay art therapy group would demonstrate a more significant and long-lasting effect on the symptoms at post-intervention than the coloring of mandala group

Ethics approval required
Old ethics approval format

Ethics approval(s)
Approved 01/09/2018, Research Ethics Committee of Hong Kong Baptist University (Graduate School, AAB 904, Level 9, Academic and Administration Building, Baptist University Road Campus, Hong Kong Baptist University, Kowloon Tong, Hong Kong; +852 3411-5127; hkburc@hkbu.edu.hk), ref: FRG1/17-18/039

Primary study design
Interventional

Study design
Randomized controlled interventional trial

Study type(s)
Treatment

Health condition(s) or problem(s) studied
Depression, anxiety and stress disorders

Interventions
Participants who fulfill the screening test will be randomly assigned to either the clay art intervention group or the mandala coloring group on a 1:1 basis with matched demographics. Each group will receive six weekly sessions of two-hour art therapy, adopting the different art approaches.

The clay art therapy group was conducted by art therapists who were competent in clay art-making. The sessions includes introduction to the fundamental kneading and pinching techniques in forming basic shapes , surface treatment and integration of various pieces of clay products to produce a 3-dimensional clay structure.

The coloring of mandala group was conducted by a group of expressive arts therapy student-therapists. The participants were guided by the student-therapists to color the pre-drawn mandala form in different shapes by using different art media and coloring techniques.

Randomisation process:
A reference number will be assigned to each participant to conceal any possible personal identification. Participants will be randomly assigned to either clay art group or waitlist control group on 1:1 basis. Allocation sequence will be generated by computer randomization program.

Intervention Type
Behavioural

Primary outcome(s)
Measured at T0 (baseline), T1 (right after intervention) and T2 (6 weeks after intervention):
1. Mood measured using The Positive and Negative Affectivity Schedule (PANAS)
2. Hope measured using the Adult Trait Hope Scale
3. Mental health measured using the Hospital Anxiety and Depression Scale (HADS)
4. Resilience measured using the Connor–Davidson Resilience Scale (CD-RISC)
5. Salivary cortisol measured using the "Salivette" kits (Starstedt, Ag & Co., Numbrecht, Germany)

Key secondary outcome(s)
Experiences of the intervention measured using focus groups at completion of the intervention

Completion date
28/02/2019

Eligibility

Key inclusion criteria
1. Hong Kong senior secondary students, aged between 15 and 18 years
2. Ability to understand and communicate in Cantonese
3. Suitable and able to perform activities in groups during the course of the 6-week program

Participant type(s)
Healthy volunteer

Healthy volunteers allowed
No

Age group
Child

Lower age limit
15 Years

Upper age limit
18 Years

Sex
All

Total final enrolment
100

Key exclusion criteria
1. Diagnosed with a mood disorder, an anxiety disorder, or any other psychiatric disorder that required medical treatment, or a professional intervention during the past 12 months (They were referred to professional services.)
2. Other medical conditions that are likely to limit group participation during the course of the 6-week program

Date of first enrolment
01/02/2017

Date of final enrolment
31/12/2018

Locations

Countries of recruitment
Hong Kong

Study participating centre
Hong Kong Baptist University
Room 1012A, 10/F AAB Buildin
Hong Kong Baptist University Road
Kowloon Tong
Hong Kong
Hong Kong
-

Sponsor information

Organisation
Hong Kong Baptist University

ROR
https://ror.org/0145fw131

Funder(s)

Funder type
University/education

Funder Name
Hong Kong Baptist University

Alternative Name(s)
, BaptistU, Hong Kong Baptist College, Hong Kong Baptist University, Kowloon, , HKBU

Funding Body Type
Government organisation

Funding Body Subtype
Universities (academic only)

Location
Hong Kong

Funder Name
University of Hong Kong

Alternative Name(s)
The University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong College of Medicine for Chinese, Universitas Hongkongensis, , HKU

Funding Body Type
Government organisation

Funding Body Subtype
Universities (academic only)

Location
Hong Kong

Results and Publications

Individual participant data (IPD) sharing plan
All data generated or analysed during this study will be included in the subsequent results publication

IPD sharing plan summary
Other

Study outputs

Output type	Details	Date created	Date added	Peer reviewed?	Patient-facing?
Protocol file			07/08/2020	No	No